Biofertilization with *Azospirillum brasilense* and *Rhizoglomus irregularare* in *Tithonia diversifolia* (Hemsl.)

Sergio Méndez-Bonet1 https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0670-7802, Pedro José González-Cañizares2 https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3206-0609, Reynerio Reyes-Rouseaux3 https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7526-8456, Juan Francisco Ramírez-Pedroso3 https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3384-3904

1Universidad Agraria de la Habana Fructuoso Rodríguez Pérez. Carrera Tapaste y Autopista Nacional km 23 1/2, San José de las Lajas, Mayabeque, Cuba. CP: 32700, Apartado Postal: 18-19. 2Instituto Nacional de Ciencias Agrícolas. Gaveta Postal No. 1. San José de las Lajas, Mayabeque. Cuba. 3Instituto de Investigaciones de Pastos y Forrajes. Avenida Independencia, km 8 ½ Boyero, La Habana, Cuba. E-mail: sergio92@uanah.edu.cu, pgonzalez@ina.edu.cu, rrmirez@pastos.vcl.minag.cu

Abstract

**Objective:** To evaluate the effect of simple and combined biofertilization of *Azospirillum brasilense* and *Rhizoglomus irregularare* on the nutritional status and biomass yield of *Tithonia diversifolia* (Hemsl.).

**Materials and Methods:** In a field experiment four treatments were studied, made up by the simple and combined inoculation of *A. brasilense* and *R. irregularare* plus a non-inoculated control, in a Latin square design. The inoculant with *R. irregularare*, with a concentration of 30 spores g⁻¹, was applied through the use of *Canavalia ensiformis* (L.) DC as preceding crop and a way for the reproduction of mycorrhizal fungi in the soil. *A. brasilense*, with a concentration of 10⁶ CFU mL⁻¹, was administered at a rate of 20 L ha⁻¹, 15 days after planting. The frequency and intensity of the mycorrhizal colonization, the concentrations of NPK in the biomass of the aerial part and dry matter yields, were evaluated.

**Results:** *R. irregularare* increased the frequency and intensity of mycorrhizal colonization, as well as the number of spores in the rhizosphere. Nevertheless, the highest effects were reached when it was applied jointly with *A. brasilense*. The biofertilizers separately increased the nitrogen concentrations in the aerial biomass and the dry matter yields, but the highest values of these variables, as well as the highest efficiency of biofertilization, were obtained with the joint application of both. The effect of biofertilization remained during the year in which the experiment was conducted.

**Conclusions:** The simple inoculation with *A. brasilense* and *R. irregularare* improves the nutrition nitrogen and biomass yields of *T. diversifolia*. With the joint application of both biofertilizers, higher effectiveness of the mycorrhizal inoculation is achieved. In addition, higher values are achieved in these indicators compared with the results reached with each one separately.

**Keywords:** *Azospirillum brasilense*, growth, nutritional status, fungi, yield

Introduction

*Tithonia diversifolia* (Hemsl.), commonly known as Mexican sunflower, is a plant of the family *Asteraceae*. Originated in Central America, it adapts well to tropical region and is cultivated in diverse countries as forage resource, due to its high biomass production, fast recovery after being cut and nutritional value (Cerdas-Ramírez, 2018).

This species extracts from the soil important quantities of nutrients for biomass production (Botero-Londoño et al., 2019), so that when it is cultivated as forage, it needs adequate fertilization to maintain its productivity and preserve fertility of the edaphic medium (López-Guzmán et al., 2017; Santos et al., 2021). However, the high prices of fertilizers and the need to promote an environment-friendly agriculture, suggest the search for fertilization strategies that guarantee adequate nutrition of the crops, decrease the use of external inputs and, in turn, ensure the protection of natural resources (Finkel et al., 2017). In the last years much attention has been paid to the use of biofertilizers, because of their direct effect on the improvement of the biological properties of the soils, increase of crop yields and reduction of the use of synthetic fertilizers (Agarwal et al., 2018).

Among the microorganisms used as biofertilizers the associative bacterium *Azospirillum brasilense* is found, capable of fixing atmospheric nitrogen and improving the crop productivity and quality, besides other benefits for the production of phytohormones, solubilization of phosphates and protection of plants against abiotic stresses (Fukami et al., 2018; Oliveira et al., 2018). In addition, the biofertilization with arbuscular mycorrhizae-forming fungi, which increase the soil volume, explore the roots and...
facilitate the absorption of nutrients and water, has shown its effectiveness in different crops (Chandrasekaran, 2020; Simó-González et al., 2020). However, few works approach the effect of the utilization of both biofertilizers on the forage production of *T. diversifolia*.

From these premises, the objective of this study was to evaluate the effect of simple and combined biofertilization of Azospirillum brasilense and *Rhizoglosmus irregulare*, on the nutritional status and biomass yield of *T. diversifolia*.

**Materials and Methods**

**Location.** The experiment was conducted in a dairy farm of the Basic Unit of Cooperative Production (UBPC, for its initials in Spanish) Juan Oramas, located in the Guanabacoa municipality, Havana province, at 23°08’ North latitude and 82°11’ West longitude.

**Soil.** The study was carried out on a carbonated smooth brown soil (Hernández-Jiménez et al., 2015), whose main chemical characteristics are shown in table 1.

For the soil analysis the following methods were applied: pH in H$_2$O (potentiometry, soil-water ratio 1:2.5), organic matter content (Walkley and Black), assimilable P (extraction with H$_2$SO$_4$, 0.5 mol L$^{-1}$ and colorimetric determination), exchangeable bases (extraction with NH$_4$Ac 1 mol L$^{-1}$ pH 7, determination by complexometry for Ca and Mg and flame photometry for Na and K) and base exchange capacity (sum of exchangeable bases), according to the analytical techniques established in the National Institute of Agricultural Sciences (INCA, for its initials in Spanish), described by Paneque et al. (2011).

**Climate conditions.** The performance of rainfall during the period in which the experiment was conducted (June, 2018-July, 2019) is shown in figure 1.

**Treatment and experimental design.** Four treatments were evaluated (biofertilization with *A. brasilense*, biofertilization with *R. irregulare*, biofertilization with *A. brasilense + R. irregulare* and a non-inoculated control), distributed in a Latin square to avoid possible variations in soil fertility and in the resident populations of arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi (AMF), originated by the spatial distribution and agronomic management of the plants previously cultivated in the area where the experiment was carried out, and which could increase the experimental error. Each treatment was distributed only once, in rows and columns. The plots constituted the experimental unit, with a total surface of 24 m$^2$ and a calculation area of 16 m$^2$.

**Experimental procedure.** The soil was prepared through plowing (plow), harrow, crossing (plow) and harrow, at approximate intervals of 25 days between each labor. Afterwards, it was plowed, and in May, 2018, all the plots were sown with *Canavalia ensiformis* (L.) DC, but it was inoculated with *R. irregulare* at the moment of planting in the two treatments corresponding to biofertilization with AMF, as a way to reproduce in the soil sufficient quantities of mycorrhizal propagules of *R. irregulare* for the later inoculation of *T. diversifolia* (Rivera et al., 2020).

*C. ensiformis* was sown at 50 cm between rows and 20 cm between plants. In the treatments with AMF, the inoculation was carried out by the method of seed covering. For such purpose a fluid paste was prepared by mixing solid inoculant and water, in proportion 1: 0.6 m v, where the seeds were submerged. They were dried under shade and immediately planted. The inoculant contained 30 spores per gram of the strain INCAM-11, of the AMF species *R. irregulare* (Sieverding et al., 2014), from the collection of the INCA.

In turn, *C. ensiformis* was cut at 60 days and its aerial biomass was removed from the field for feeding the animals. Table 2 shows the quantity of AMF spores that remained in the soil in the plots corresponding to each treatment, after cutting *C. ensiformis* and at the moment of planting *T. diversifolia*.

After cutting *C. ensiformis*, the soil was furrowed and *T. diversifolia* was sown, which was

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>pH H$_2$O</th>
<th>OM %</th>
<th>P mg kg$^{-1}$</th>
<th>Ca$^{2+}$</th>
<th>Mg$^{2+}$</th>
<th>Na$^+$</th>
<th>K$^+$</th>
<th>BEC cmol kg$^{-1}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7,6</td>
<td>4,49</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>51,3</td>
<td>5,5</td>
<td>0,22</td>
<td>0,91</td>
<td>57,93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(0,1)</td>
<td>(0,20)</td>
<td>(18)</td>
<td>(2,4)</td>
<td>(0,9)</td>
<td>(0,09)</td>
<td>(0,12)</td>
<td>(3,75)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OM: organic matter, BEC: base exchange capacity. Values between parentheses indicate confidence intervals (α=0,05)
done through vegetative propagules of approximately 30 cm of length, taken from the top and medium part of the stems of a field cultivated with this species, very close to the experimental area. The propagules were planted at 1.0 m between rows and 0.5 m between plants.

At the moment of planting *T. diversifolia*, in each plot composite soil samples were taken, at a depth of 0-20 cm, on which pH in H$_2$O and the contents of organic matter, assimilable P, exchangeable bases and determination of Ca and Mg, Na and K, and base exchange capacity, were determined.

For the biofertilization with *A. brasilense* the commercial product Nitrofix® was used, from the Cuban Research Institute of Sugarcane Derivatives (ICIDCA, for its initials in Spanish), which contained the strain 8I, with a concentration of $10^9$ CFU mL$^{-1}$. A mixture of liquid inoculant and water was prepared in 1:10 v/v ratio. Through a manual knapsack, 20 L ha$^{-1}$ of the commercial product were applied to the soil. It was administered very close to the rows, 15 days after the sprouting of *T. diversifolia*. The experiment was conducted without irrigation and no basal fertilization was applied.

Measurements. Four cuts were performed. The first one was done 120 days after planting (November, 2018) and the others in February, May and July, 2019, at a height of 30 cm from the soil surface. In each cut the fresh biomass of the aerial part corresponding to the calculation area of the plots was weighed. Samples of 200 g were taken, which were carried to an air circulation stove at 70 °C during 72 h, to calculate the dry matter percentage (DM) and estimate the DM yield. In the second and fourth cut, the N, P, K concentrations (g kg$^{-1}$ DM) in the biomass were determined (Paneque *et al*., 2011).

At the moment of the second and fourth cut, framed in the rainy and dry seasons, respectively, three subsamples of roots and soil of the rhizosphere of each plot were taken, at depth of 0-20 cm. For such purpose, a metallic cylinder of 5 cm diameter and 20 cm of height was used. The sampling points were distributed equidistantly and separated by 10 cm from the rows.

The subsamples were homogenized to form a composite sample per plot and 1 g of rootlets was extracted for its staining and clarification (Rodríguez-Yon *et al*., 2015). The frequency of mycorrhizal colonization through the method of intercepts (Giovanetti and Mosse, 1980) and the visual density or colonization intensity, according to Trouvelot *et al.* (1986), were evaluated, as well as the number of spores in the rhizosphere from the wet-sieving and decanting of such structures and their observation in the microscope (Herrera *et al*., 1995).

The efficiency index (EI) of biofertilization was determined by the following formula:

$$EI: \frac{\text{Accumulated DM yield (t ha}^{-1}) \text{ of the biofertilized treatment} - \text{Accumulated DM yield (t ha}^{-1}) \text{ of the control treatment}}{\text{Yield of the cumulative DM (t ha}^{-1}) \text{ of the control treatment}} \times 100$$

Mathematical analysis. The data, once the variance normality and homogeneity were tested, were processed through variance analysis and Tukey’s test (p < 0.05). In the variables corresponding to the chemical characteristics of the soil and the number of AMF spores that remained in the soil after cutting *C. ensiformis* (tables 1 and 2), as well
The inoculation with *R. irregulare* increased the colonization frequency and intensity and the number of spores in the rhizosphere (fig. 2), which proved the effectiveness of this strain to colonize the roots of *T. diversifolia*. Nevertheless, the highest values were reached with the joint application of both biofertilizers. This performance could be ascribed to the increase of the colonization sites of the AMF from the positive effect exerted by the phytohormones produced by *A. brasilense* on the increase of root length and branching and, consequently, on the formation and multiplication of the mycorrhizal structures (Raklami et al., 2019).

The effect of *R. irregulare* was observed even in the fourth cut (July, 2019). That is, 12 months after planting *T. diversifolia*. Even the values of mycorrhizal colonization frequency, intensity and number of spores in the rhizosphere in this cut were higher than those recorded in the second one (February, 2019). This performance could be related to the seasons in which the sampling was conducted. During the rainy season a fast growth of crops occurs, due to the increase of rainfall volumes, temperature and luminosity. This implies the absorption of higher quantity of nutrients for biomass formation and, consequently, the formation of higher quantities of mycorrhizal structures to guarantee the access of plants to the soil resources (Bhardwaj and Chandra, 2018).

The increase of the fungal variables in the treatments inoculated with *R. irregulare* also confirms the report by Rivera et al. (2020) about the effectiveness of the use of *C. ensiformis* as preceding crop and as a way for the mycorrhizal inoculation of the later crop, which implies an important reduction of the inoculant quantities to be used.

### Table 2. Quantities of spores that remained in the soil after cutting *C. ensiformis*.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Number of spores (50 g⁻¹ of soil)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>87 (± 10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>R. intraradices</em></td>
<td>322 (± 15)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>A. brasilense</em></td>
<td>93 (± 17)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>R. intraradices</em> + <em>A. brasilense</em></td>
<td>331 (± 9)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Values between parentheses indicate confidence intervals (α=0.05)
According to the inoculation method used, in which a quantity of inoculant equivalent to 10% of the seed or propagule weight, in T. diversifolia would imply the utilization of 100 kg ha\(^{-1}\) of inoculant. However, with the utilization of previously-inoculated C. ensiformis, as a way for the inoculation of T. diversifolia from the mycorrhizal propagules left by this crop on the soil, the quantity of inoculant was reduced to 6 kg ha\(^{-1}\).

Table 3 shows the effect of biofertilization on the N, P and K concentrations in the biomass of the aerial part, in the second and fourth cut. R. irregularare and A. brasilense increased the N concentrations with regards to the non-inoculated treatment, although no significant differences were detected between both treatments. Yet, the highest effects were obtained with the joint application of the biofertilizers. No significant differences were found between the treatments for the N, P and K concentrations in the biomass. This performance was in correspondence with the high contents of both nutrients in the soil (Paneque and Calaña, 2001).

The dry matter yields had a similar performance to the one observed in the concentrations of nutrients in the biomass (table 4). That is, with the separate application of one or the other biofertilizer there was significant increase in this indicator, and both showed similar values. Nevertheless, the highest effect was obtained through the co-inoculation with both microorganisms.

The effect of biofertilizers on the increase of T. diversifolia yields seems to be related to their influence on the increase of N concentrations in the biomass. It is known that this crop absorbs important quantities of N (Santos et al., 2021), and judging by the organic matter content of the soil where the experiment was conducted, which is classified as moderate (Paneque and Calaña, 2001), the availability of this element in the soil might not have been sufficient to satisfy the crop demand. Thus, the biofertilizers could have contributed to satisfy these needs and, consequently, to improve the biomass yields.

When analyzing the efficiency index of biofertilization, which shows in percentage increase the biomass yields of each inoculated treatment with regards to the non-inoculated control, there were no differences between the separate application of one and the other biofertilizer. However, the highest value was obtained with the joint application of both (fig. 3).

AMF actively participate in the transference of N and other soil nutrients to the host plant through the mycelium network that increases the absorption

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Second cut</th>
<th>Fourth cut</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>26,7(^{c})</td>
<td>2,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R. irregularare</td>
<td>32,1(^{b})</td>
<td>2,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. brasilense</td>
<td>31,7(^{b})</td>
<td>2,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R. irregularare + A. brasilense</td>
<td>36,8(^{a})</td>
<td>2,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE ±</td>
<td>0,501</td>
<td>0,213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P - value</td>
<td>0,002</td>
<td>0,347</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Different letters in the same column significantly differ, according to Tukey’s test (p < 0,05)

Table 4. Effect of the biofertilizers on the biomass yield of T. diversifolia (t dry matter ha\(^{-1}\)).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>3,7(^{c})</td>
<td>3,5(^{c})</td>
<td>3,3(^{c})</td>
<td>5,9(^{c})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R. irregularare</td>
<td>4,4(^{b})</td>
<td>4,2(^{b})</td>
<td>4,0(^{b})</td>
<td>6,6(^{b})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. brasilense</td>
<td>4,4(^{b})</td>
<td>4,3(^{b})</td>
<td>4,0(^{b})</td>
<td>6,7(^{b})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R. irregularare + A. brasilense</td>
<td>5,1(^{c})</td>
<td>5,0(^{c})</td>
<td>4,6(^{c})</td>
<td>7,5(^{c})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE ±</td>
<td>0,181</td>
<td>0,162</td>
<td>0,153</td>
<td>0,204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P - value</td>
<td>0,002</td>
<td>0,001</td>
<td>0,002</td>
<td>0,001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Averages with different letters in the same column significantly differ, according to Tukey’s test (p < 0,05).
capacity of the roots of plants (Yu et al., 2020). A. brasilense can fix important quantities of atmospheric N and transfer it to the host plant (Aguirre et al., 2018). This is translated into an increase of yield, even, into a reduction of the needs of this nutrient, via fertilization (Leite et al., 2019). But the fact that the highest effects have been obtained with the joint application of both biofertilizers proves that their benefits are complemented, which brings about a higher agronomic response than with the application of one or the other separately.

Siddaram et al. (2017) and Kamali and Mehraban (2020), when evaluating the effects of the co-inoculation with A. brasilense and AMF observed a tripartite interaction between both microorganisms and the host plant, whose synergic relations caused increase in the concentrations of nutrients and in plant growth, significantly higher than those reached with the application of each microorganism separately. Another interesting aspect was the permanence of the effect of biofertilizers on the soil-plant system, which was observed even twelve months after planting T. diversifolia. This suggests that the benefits of biofertilization could be extended beyond that period, and suggests conducting studies in this regard.

It is concluded that the single inoculation with A. brasilense and R. irregularare improves the nitrogen nutrition and biomass yields of Tithonia diversifolia. With the joint application of both fertilizers, higher effectiveness of the mycorrhizal inoculation and values of these higher indicators area are achieved than those reached with each one separately. To study further about the co-inoculation with A. brasilense and R. irregularare and its contribution to the reduction of the use of biofertilizers is suggested.

Acknowledgements
The authors thank the Science and Innovation Financial Fund (FONCI, for its initials in Spanish) for the contribution to funding the execution of this work. Gratitude is also expressed to the M. Sc. Ana N. San Juan Rodriguez and Daisy Dopico Ramirez, specialists of the Cuban Sugarcane Derivative Research Institute, for donating the biofertilizer Nitrofix® for the execution of the experiment.

Conflict of interests
The authors declare that there are no conflicts of interests among them.

Authors’ contribution
- Sergio Méndez-Bonet. Participated in the execution of the experiment that led to the elaboration of the paper. Participated in the statistical processing and interpretation of the experimental results and in the paper writing.
- Pedro José González-Cañizares. Led the research task that allowed the elaboration of the paper, participated in the design of the experiment and interpretation of the results.
- Reynerio Reyes-Rouseaux. Participated in the execution of the experiment that led to the elaboration of the paper and participated in the interpretation of the results.
- Juan Francisco Ramirez-Pedroso. Participated in the execution of the experiment that led to the elaboration of the paper. Participated in the design and interpretation of the results of the experiment.

Biblographic references


